

Queiros J (Joao)

From: John Uttley <John.Uttley@snh.gov.uk>
Sent: 17 July 2014 09:04
To: Holland G (Gayle)
Cc: Tait A (Adrian) (MARLAB); Catriona Gall; Alex Robbins; 'Sue.O'Brien@jncc.gov.uk'; 'Karen.Hall@jncc.gov.uk'
Subject: RE: Further puffin advice from SNH & JNCC

Gayle

I was off yesterday but Alex drafted some text, below.

We previously advised that the starting point for displacement is a rate of 60% for auks and 40% for kittiwakes, noting that these are precautionary and semi-quantitative rates. They are not based on any particular reference wind farm or empirical evidence of displacement but they do accord with disturbance scores derived from Furness et al. 2013. There is some evidence to support reduced displacement rates with a reduced turbine density and we agree that it is reasonable to expect reductions in turbine density to reduce displacement.

Auks

Our most recent advice for puffin displacement took account of this in a semi-quantitative manner. JNCC and SNH consider that the most recent advice we have given with regards to puffin would also apply to the other auk species, guillemot and razorbill:

*Although aware of the limitations we have reviewed the densities of existing and consented wind farms (OWEZ, PAWP and the Moray Firth wind farms) alongside the densities proposed for the four Forth and Tay developments. **We advise that, given the lower turbine densities and greater spacing of the Seagreen and ICOL wind farms displacement rates of 40% for Seagreen and 50% for ICOL are justified. However, the current rate of 60% should still apply to Neart na Goithe.***

We note that this would likely reduced the predicted impacts. However, we cannot provide MS with any advice on how this would change the impacts, as there are no modelled outputs for these displacement rates. We can therefore only advise that the risks we identified in approaching the razorbill threshold would be less, but by an unquantifiable amount, and therefore should still be considered as we have outlined to Marine Scotland.

Kittiwake

For kittiwake we would again consider using a semi-quantitative approach, we have previously advised that it may be appropriate to use a lower rate than 40% for Seagreen, but not so for either ICOL or Neart na Gaiothe. In this particular case we were able to support a displacement rate of 30% for Seagreen, based on the very low turbine densities in Seagreen's proposal. In light of a further review of the turbine densities we consider that displacement of kittiwake by ICOL is also likely to less than 40%, but more than 30%. As mentioned above, there are no empirical outputs for any alternative displacement rates for ICOL, so we are unable to consider or advise how this would change the magnitude of impacts. We therefore advise MS that ICOL assessments at 40% be considered as precautionary.

We also reiterate that this advice is without prejudice to any advice on displacement rates we may give in future. This area of knowledge is moving rapidly and due to the current lack of empirical data to derive displacement rates, we will review and revise our advice on displacement, in light of any evidence that becomes available.

Regards
J

John Uttley | Principal Adviser | Planning & Renewables Unit | Scottish Natural Heritage | www.snh.gov.uk | 01595 693345 | 07876447403

From: Gayle.Holland@scotland.gsi.gov.uk [mailto:Gayle.Holland@scotland.gsi.gov.uk]
Sent: 15 July 2014 13:05
To: John Uttley
Cc: Adrian.Tait@scotland.gsi.gov.uk
Subject: RE: Further puffin advice from SNH & JNCC
Importance: High

Hi John,
Please could you confirm if the displacement rates advised for puffin on the 4th July (i.e. 40% for Seagreen and 50% for InchCape) also apply to other auk species.

In addition the email sent on 17th July stated that the SNCBs advise no reduction in the displacement rate for kittiwake at Inch Cape (i.e. remaining at the original 40% figure). Is this still the case, or has the SNCB further consideration of displacement rates and turbine spacing changed this advice.

Please confirm asap
Many thanks
Gayle

From: John Uttley [mailto:John.Uttley@snh.gov.uk]
Sent: 04 July 2014 13:44
To: McKie J (Jim) (MARLAB); Holland G (Gayle)
Subject: Further puffin advice from SNH & JNCC

Jim, Gayle

As agreed last Friday, here is our re-consideration of puffin advice, incorporating reconsideration of the displacement rate and the MacArthur Green model. In short, we have recommended:

- revised displacement rates, more or less in line with MSS but less precise and slightly lower in the case of Inch Cape
- that we still lack confidence in use of the MacArthur Green population model to conclude no adverse effects on puffin from Forth Islands SPA

Regards
J

John Uttley has sent you a copy of "2014 07 04 - further puffin advice" (A1336347) v1.0 from Objective.

Scotland welcomes the world in the **Year of Homecoming Scotland 2014!**

The year-long programme of events will celebrate the very best of Scotland's food and drink, active and natural resources as well as our creativity, culture and ancestral heritage.

This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager or the sender.

Please note that for business purposes, outgoing and incoming emails from and to SNH may be monitored.

Tha am post-dealain seo agus fiosrachadh sam bith na chois dìomhair agus airson an neach no buidheann ainmichte a-mhàin. Mas e gun d' fhuair sibh am post-dealain seo le mearachd, cuiribh fios dhan manaidsear-siostaim no neach-sgrìobhaidh.

Thoiribh an aire airson adhbharan gnòthaich, 's dòcha gun tèid sùil a chumail air puist-dealain a' tighinn a-steach agus a' dol a-mach bho SNH.

This email was scanned by the Government Secure Intranet anti-virus service supplied by Vodafone in partnership with Symantec. (CCTM Certificate Number 2009/09/0052.) In case of problems, please call your organisations IT Helpdesk. Communications via the GSI may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

This email has been received from an external party and has been swept for the presence of computer viruses.

This e-mail (and any files or other attachments transmitted with it) is intended solely for the attention of the addressee(s). Unauthorised use, disclosure, storage, copying or distribution of any part of this e-mail is not permitted. If you are not the intended recipient please destroy the email, remove any copies from your system and inform the sender immediately by return.

Communications with the Scottish Government may be monitored or recorded in order to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes. The views or opinions contained within this e-mail may not necessarily reflect those of the Scottish Government.

Tha am post-d seo (agus faidhle neo ceanglan còmhla ris) dhan neach neo luchd-ainmichte a-mhàin. Chan eil e ceadaichte a chleachdadh ann an dòigh sam bith, a' toirt a-steach còraichean, foillseachadh neo sgaoileadh, gun chead. Ma 's e is gun d'fhuair sibh seo le gun fhiosd', bu choir cur às dhan phost-d agus lethbhreac sam bith air an t-siostam agaibh, leig fios chun neach a sgaoil am post-d gun dàil.

Dh'fhaodadh gum bi teachdaireachd sam bith bho Riaghaltas na h-Alba air a chlàradh neo air a sgrùdadh airson dearbhadh gu bheil an siostam ag obair gu h-èifeachdach neo airson adhbhar laghail eile. Dh'fhaodadh nach eil beachdan anns a' phost-d seo co-ionann ri beachdan Riaghaltas na h-Alba.

The original of this email was scanned for viruses by the Government Secure Intranet virus scanning service supplied by Vodafone in partnership with Symantec. (CCTM Certificate Number 2009/09/0052.) This email has been certified virus free.

Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

Scotland welcomes the world in the **Year of Homecoming Scotland 2014!**

The year-long programme of events will celebrate the very best of Scotland's food and drink, active and natural resources as well as our creativity, culture and ancestral heritage.

homecomingscotland.com

This email and any files transmitted with it are confidential and intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you have received this email in error please notify the system manager or the sender.

Please note that for business purposes, outgoing and incoming emails from and to SNH may be monitored.

Tha am post-dealain seo agus fiosrachadh sam bith na chois dìomhair agus airson an neach no buidheann ainmichte a-mhàin. Mas e gun d' fhuair sibh am post-dealain seo le mearachd, cuiribh fios dhan manaidsear-siostaim no neach-sgrìobhaidh.

Thoiribh an aire airson adhbharan gnothaich, 's dòcha gun tèid sùil a chumail air puist-dealain a' tighinn

a-steach agus a' dol a-mach bho SNH.

This email was scanned by the Government Secure Intranet anti-virus service supplied by Vodafone in partnership with Symantec. (CCTM Certificate Number 2009/09/0052.) In case of problems, please call your organisations IT Helpdesk.
Communications via the GSi may be automatically logged, monitored and/or recorded for legal purposes.

This email has been received from an external party and

has been swept for the presence of computer viruses.
